

CALIFORNIA COMMISSION ON DISABILITY ACCESS EDUCATION AND OUTREACH COMMITTEE

Teleconference Meeting Minutes June 23, 2020

1. Call to Order

Chair Chris Downey welcomed everyone and called the meeting of the Education and Outreach (E&O) Committee of the California Commission on Disability Access (CCDA) to order at approximately 10:00 a.m. Due to the ongoing health emergency, and consistent with Executive Order N-25-20 and Executive Order N-29-20, this meeting was conducted entirely by Microsoft Teams teleconference.

Staff Member Saenz reviewed the meeting protocols.

Roll Call

Staff Member Saenz called the roll and confirmed the presence of a quorum.

Commissioners Present:

Chris Downey, Chair
Michael Paravagna

Committee Members Absent:

Richard Ray
Stephen Simon

Committee Members Present:

Arnie Lerner
Tracy Walsh

Commissioners Absent:

Karla Prieto

Other Commissioner Present:

Souraya Sue ElHessen, Ph.D.

Staff Present:

Angela Jemmott, Executive Director
Dave Chung, Data and Research Analyst
LaCandice Ochoa, Operations Manager
Davina Saenz, Marketing and Outreach Analyst

Also Present:

Jennifer Lida, California Department of General Services (DGS)
Beth Maynard, California Building Standards Commission
Terry McLean, Architect, Certified Access Specialist (CAsp)
Miranda Ruiz, Speech and Language Pathologist
Mehdi Shadyab, City of San Diego
Bill Zellmer, Sutter Health

2. Approval of Meeting Minutes (May 14, 2019) – Action

**California Commission on Disability Access
Education and Outreach Committee
June 23, 2020, Teleconference Meeting Minutes**

MOTION: Commissioner Paravagna moved to approve the May 14, 2019, California Commission on Disability Access Education and Outreach Committee Meeting Minutes as presented. Committee Member Lerner seconded. Motion carried unanimously with no abstentions.

3. Comments from the Public on Issues Not on this Agenda

No members of the public addressed the Committee.

4. Committee Membership – Update, Discussion, and Action

a. New Member: Tracy Walsh, Disability Rights California

Executive Director Jemmott introduced Tracy Walsh and welcomed her to the Committee.

b. Review Current Roster

Chair Downey stated the need to recruit additional members to the Committee.

c. Determine Additional Organizations that can be Represented on Committee

Chair Downey suggested including representatives from the small business community on the E&O Committee. He asked for ideas about other groups to focus recruitment on to increase the diversity of the Committee.

Commissioner Paravagna suggested outreaching to individuals with disabilities who have experienced issues with attempting to access businesses in a variety of ways. Those insights would be educational to everyone involved.

Commissioner ElHessen suggested reaching out to chambers of commerce that deal with small businesses and doing presentations to educate businesses about the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) and how it impacts businesses and how revenue can be increased through marketing and supporting the disability community.

Executive Director Jemmott agreed with including business representation on the Committee but asked the Committee to consider including those individuals and other new recruits on a task force. They would participate in Committee meetings but would not impact the quorum.

Action Items

- Committee Members are to provide ideas to staff for groups to focus recruitment on to increase the diversity of the E&O Committee.

5. CCDA Website – Update and Discussion

**California Commission on Disability Access
Education and Outreach Committee
June 23, 2020, Teleconference Meeting Minutes**

a. New Tool: Website Accessibility Auditing Tool

Staff Member Saenz stated the DGS has adopted a new auditing tool, called the "Level Access Accessibility Management Platform (AMP)". Level Access AMP scans the website on a weekly basis and provides a report of the website's accessibility score according to ADA standards. She announced that the CCDA has a 100 percent accessibility score. This tool will help CCDA remain accessible at all times.

b. New Educational Materials Available

Executive Director Jemmott stated the Myths and Misconceptions tool has been translated into Mandarin and is posted on the website, along with the Spanish and English versions.

Chair Downey asked if Spanish- and Mandarin-speaking individuals can navigate the CCDA website themselves.

Executive Director Jemmott stated the website is currently only in English. This tool is meant to be passed on to individuals. She stated the new translation came about through conversations with business district leadership. The idea is to provide access to the CCDA website for business districts that will then post the tool to their websites in the languages presented and will provide hardcopies at their meetings.

Chair Downey suggested making the website available in Spanish and Mandarin in the future.

Staff Member Ochoa stated the DGS website has a temporary solution of a translate option offered through Google.

Commissioner ElHessen suggested making the tool available to universities.

Action Items

- Discuss making the CCDA website available in Spanish and Mandarin.

6. CCDA 2020-21 Marketing Campaign: Accessible Parking – Update, Discussion, and Action

a. Overview of Campaign

i. Disability Access Considerations – Curbside/Open Air Dining

ii. Developing Accessible Parking Toolkit

1. Gathering Frequently Asked Questions (FAQ) from Business Community Regarding Accessibility Compliance Concerns

Executive Director Jemmott stated the need for a marketing campaign focusing on accessible parking issues. She reviewed the ongoing accessible parking issues document and the Open-Air Dining Disability Access Considerations document, drafted by Terry McLean, Certified Access Specialist (CASP), which were included in the meeting

**California Commission on Disability Access
Education and Outreach Committee
June 23, 2020, Teleconference Meeting Minutes**

packet. She asked for feedback on the open-air dining one-pager being part of the campaign and how to launch the campaign throughout the state.

Commissioner ElHessen asked if restaurants are using the disabled parking spaces as part of their open-air dining option during the COVID-19 pandemic.

Public Comment

Terry McLean, Architect, CASp, stated businesses are allowed to set up tables and chairs on public sidewalks and to take up parking spaces. Depending on if the parking spaces are adjacent to the restaurants, they may or may not be an issue. Typically, the accessible parking spaces are closest to the door so those may be the most logical spaces to use. She noted that there are updates she would like to make to her Open-Air Dining Disability Access Considerations document.

Questions and Discussion, continued

Commissioner ElHessen asked how to quickly make the open-air dining one-pager available to small businesses. She stated she will be meeting today with the mayor of her city.

Chair Downey stated the need to push this initiative forward for the protection of small businesses and for increased business and also to consider proactive enforcement. He asked how this applies in urban settings.

Commissioner Paravagna suggested creating a guidance document that deals with issues being brought up to be disseminated in partnership with the California League of Cities or the California Chamber of Commerce (CalChamber) so there is a link with other organizations and their distribution lists. He stated concern about restaurants putting tables and chairs on sidewalks to create outside dining areas, which impede the path of travel for individuals with visual impairments.

Chair Downey agreed and stated the need to maintain the minimum requirements of the path of travel past sidewalk dining, which is difficult. He stated zoning regulations from jurisdictions vary as to the requirement for barricades, planters, or barrier systems at either end of dining zones. It is important to secure the end of each outdoor dining zone on a public sidewalk.

Commissioner Paravagna suggested creating a guidance document on this issue. It would help all parties involved.

Chair Downey agreed and stated the sooner it can be made widely available across the state the better. This is a great opportunity to create helpful guidance as businesses are beginning to move this direction to ensure they are doing it in an appropriate way.

Committee Member Lerner stated a permit is required through the planning department in San Francisco to have tables on the sidewalk, even though planning departments do not generally have anything to do with accessibility.

**California Commission on Disability Access
Education and Outreach Committee
June 23, 2020, Teleconference Meeting Minutes**

Commissioner ElHessen suggested, as part of enforcement, providing that guidance document to businesses getting a business license.

Executive Director Jemmott suggested including language about common curtesy and communication in the Open-Air Dining Disability Access Considerations document to clarify what is trying to be accomplished for the good of everyone.

Public Comment

Mehdi Shadyab, CASp, city of San Diego, stated the city of San Diego is allowing small businesses to utilize sidewalks and streets as an expansion of their businesses at specific times during the week; however, sidewalks and streets are considered public rights-of-way. As such, utilizing them requires a permit from development services. As part of the permit review, the city ensures that the minimum width requirements are maintained for the purposes of accessibility from the point of view of the state regulations as well as ADA requirements. The city is cognizant of that fact and looks into providing equal facilitation to ensure that those spaces being utilized by the general public are also available to individuals with disabilities.

Questions and Discussion, continued

Executive Director Jemmott suggested adding an excerpt from the newly-updated checklist for inspectors to the Open-Air Dining Disability Access Considerations document. It contains approximately ten categories within the parking lot. She also asked Terry McLean to consider adding legal terms to the Open-Air Dining Disability Access Considerations document that this information is not inclusive but, for additional information, to contact a CASp for requirements specific for each business.

Committee Member Lerner suggested disseminating this document not only to building departments but also to public works and city planning departments.

b. Additional Campaign Ideas and Strategies

Public Comment

Bill Zellmer, Program Manager, Physical Access and Regulatory Affairs, Sutter Health, stated Sutter Health has been dealing with accessibility issues related to the COVID-19 pandemic. He gave the examples of a temporary setup to check patients in the parking lot blocked off the accessible route to the building and not allowing patients in without a mask but not considering that individuals who are deaf may need to read lips.

Terry McLean agreed and stated reading lips and facial expressions for punctuation are necessary for the deaf and hard of hearing community.

Questions and Discussion, continued

Commissioner ElHessen stated there are now face masks available with a clear or transparent cover at the mouth area to facilitate lip reading. She suggested providing a resource link for individuals with disabilities, medical professionals, and small businesses to access the masks.

**California Commission on Disability Access
Education and Outreach Committee
June 23, 2020, Teleconference Meeting Minutes**

Chair Downey suggesting including language to raise awareness for businesses that people with disabilities may need special accommodation, which may include that servers remove their masks to communicate and to work with customers to establish an appropriate means of communication.

Public Comment

Miranda Ruiz, Speech and Language Pathologist, stated it would be helpful for businesses to make White Boards available to aid in communication with customers. Moving masks compromises health and safety.

Action Items

- Staff is to provide a resource link for individuals with disabilities, medical professionals, and small businesses to access masks with transparent mouth areas.

7. ADA 30 Year Anniversary (ADA30) – Update, Discussion, and Action

a. Overview of ADA30

i. Commissioner Testimonials on CCDA Website

Executive Director Jemmott stated the 30th Anniversary of the ADA will be celebrated this year. She reviewed the Ideas for Celebrating the ADA 30th Anniversary document, which was included in the meeting packet. She suggested highlighting various celebration events occurring throughout the nation on the CCDA website for the month of July and asking Commissioners to submit answers to a set of staff questions, which will be posted in the Commissioners' Corner section of the website.

b. Additional Campaign Ideas and Strategies

Chair Downey suggested increasing awareness by recommending "Crip Camp: A Disability Revolution," a Netflix documentary about the disability rights movement leading up to the passage of the ADA.

Commissioner ElHessen suggested also recommending "Inclusion: The Story of the ADA," a documentary put out by the Statewide Independent Living Council of Georgia on how the ADA came to be, what has happened since, and what is needed to keep moving forward toward inclusion for all. She stated, although "Crip Camp" is good, it is lengthy. "Inclusion" will be a 15- to 20-minute film. Individuals with disabilities continue to be left out in all races and ethnicities in regard to equity. It is important to bring to light that inclusion is for all. She stated she will share this information with the mayor during their meeting later today.

Executive Director Jemmott suggested highlighting the website adaanniversary.org on the CCDA website, along with the media kit on social media that Jennifer Lida, from DGS, gave to staff.

**California Commission on Disability Access
Education and Outreach Committee
June 23, 2020, Teleconference Meeting Minutes**

Commissioner ElHessen stated she will share this information with the mayor during their meeting later today.

Executive Director Jemmott asked Commissioner ElHessen to ask the mayor for a quote to be included in the Commissioners' Corner section of the CCDA website.

Chair Downey recommended "Ignorance is the enemy within: On the power of our privilege, and the privilege of our power," a post that Darren Walker, President of the Ford Foundation, issued in 2016. It is a poignant and timely statement that provides language and reflection in a broader context of the social justice and civil rights discussions happening today.

Chair Downey challenged all CCDA Commissioners to get 30 quotes to post in the Commissioners' Corner section of the CCDA website in celebration of the 30-year anniversary of the ADA.

Commissioner Paravagna suggested contacting former Commissioners who have contributed greatly to CCDA's efforts to ask them to say a few words.

Action Items

- Commissioners to submit answers to a set of staff questions, which will be posted in the Commissioners' Corner section of the website.
- Commissioners are to get quotes from individuals in leadership positions to post in the Commissioners' Corner section of the website.

8. Future Agenda Items

Commissioner Paravagna suggested a discussion on celebrating the 31st anniversary of the ADA, given that the COVID-19 pandemic did not allow for a full celebration this year.

9. Adjourn

MOTION: Committee Member Walsh moved to adjourn the June 23, 2020, California Commission on Disability Access Education and Outreach Committee meeting. Commissioner Paravagna seconded. Motion carried unanimously.

Chair Downey adjourned the meeting at approximately 11:30 a.m.